

THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY

Entered as second-class matter November 18, 1907, at the Post Office, New York, N. Y., under the Act of Congress of March 1, 1897

VOL. VIII

NEW YORK, MAY 22, 1915

No. 28

The Ninth Annual Meeting of The Classical Association of the Atlantic States was held at Swarthmore College, Swarthmore, Pennsylvania, on May 7-8. The weather was good, so that it was possible to enjoy to the utmost the beautiful Campus of the College. Every preparation had been made by the authorities of the College for the comfort of the members and visitors; throughout the meeting these plans were carried out perfectly. The students of the College, many of them, men and women both, generously surrendered their rooms for the use of those members and visitors who spent Friday night at Swarthmore. The annual dinner, at which 106 were present, was held in the smaller dining room of the College, and proved a thoroughly delightful occasion. Many members and visitors enjoyed breakfast at the College dining-room on Saturday morning, and more (114) were there at luncheon. One hundred and thirty persons registered as in attendance at the meeting, but others who were present did not register. On Friday evening, after the dinner and the paper which followed it, there was an informal reception by President and Mrs. Swain in the College Library, whose reading room proved well adapted to the purpose. On every side on Saturday one heard expressions of satisfaction with the meeting. No idle words were the resolutions of thanks passed by the Association (see below).

Those who were present at this meeting felt that, from the point of view of the members, the ideal place for the annual meetings is a College like Haverford or Swarthmore, where the members and visitors can live together, as it were, for a day or two, in surroundings at once academic and charming in the loveliness of their physical setting.

The programme was as follows:

Friday afternoon, May 7, at 2.30: Address of Welcome, by Dr. Joseph Swain, President of Swarthmore College; Response, by Dr. W. F. Little, President of the Association; Paper, Latin and Football, by Professor F. O. Ryder, of Western Maryland College; Paper (illustrated), Sparta, Ancient and Modern, by Professor George E. Howes, of Williams College, Delegate from The Classical Association of New England; Report of the Secretary-Treasurer: Report of the Executive Committee: Appointment of Committees; Paper, The Lucretian Theory of Providence, by Professor George D. Hadzsits, of the University of Pennsylvania; Paper, Reactions to the Latin Stimulus, by Miss Mary B. Rockwood, Western High School, Baltimore; Paper, The Socialization of the Classics,

by Dr. Mason D. Gray, of the East High School, Rochester, New York.

Friday evening, Annual Dinner, at 7. After the dinner, Paper, A Point in the Interpretation of the Antigone of Sophocles, by Professor Charles Knapp, of Barnard College, Columbia University.

Saturday morning, May 8, at 9.15. Rendition of a new musical setting of Horace, Carmina 1.8, written by Mr. Russell H. Miles, who was graduated from the Central High School, Philadelphia, in February last. The music was played by Mr. Miles, and sung by Miss Marie Loughney, of Philadelphia; Paper, Latin in its Rightful Place, by Miss Annie Gendell, of the William Penn High School, Philadelphia; Paper, The Interest of Late and Medieval Latin to the High School Teacher, by Professor Charles Upson Clark, Delegate from Yale University; Paper, By-Paths in Caesarean Bibliography, by Professor Frederic Stanley Dunn, of the University of Oregon (read by Professor Walton Brooks McDaniel, of the University of Pennsylvania); Paper, Caesar as Seen in his Works, by Professor Gonzalez Lodge, Teachers College, Columbia University.

Saturday afternoon, at 2. Papers (illustrated) on (a) The Olcott Collection, Columbia University, and on the Models at Hunter College, by Miss Helen Tanzer, Hunter College; (b) The Johns Hopkins Classical Museum, by Professor R. V. D. Magoffin, of The Johns Hopkins University; (c) The University of Pennsylvania Museum, by Miss Edith Hall, Assistant Curator of the Mediterranean Section of the Museum; (d) The Metropolitan Museum, New York City, by Miss G. M. A. Richter, Assistant Curator of the Classical Department of the Museum; The Saalburg Collection at Washington University, St. Louis, by Professor Charles Knapp, Barnard College, Columbia University.

The papers proved interesting and profitable, and, within the limits of time available for discussion, called forth a lively interchange of views.

The Executive Committee reported that the accounts of the Secretary-Treasurer had been audited, prior to the meeting, by Messrs. Roscoe Guernsey and William S. Messer, of Columbia University, and that they had been found in all respects correct. The Committee, further, had gone in much detail over the report of the Secretary-Treasurer, and had approved it. For the Committee two motions were presented and unanimously passed. By the first it was ordered that rebate shall be paid hereafter to local Classical Associations (50 cents per member) only on such persons as pay their dues both to the local Classical Association and to The Classical Association of the Atlantic States on or before November 30 of each year. By the other motion the amount appropriated for clerical

assistance, in connection with the increasing business of the Association and of THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY, was made \$500 per year.

The following is an abstract of the report of the Secretary-Treasurer:

The balance on hand in the treasury of The Classical Association of the Atlantic States, April 11, 1914, was \$525.69: collected, during the year, for back dues, \$34.00, for current dues, \$1,084.20, for dues for 1915-1916, \$292.30, for interest, \$26.10, for annual dinner and luncheon, 1914, \$138.50, for advertising, from THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY (that is, for contribution to expense of circulars meant to secure members, from which THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY derives profit), \$15.00, from sale of the two pamphlets (the Practical Value of Latin and the Reprint of Professor Cooper's paper), \$22.50, for cost of printing circulars sent out in behalf of Art and Archaeology (paid for by The Archaeological Institute of America), \$6.00: total in the funds, \$2144.29. The expenditures included these items: annual dinner, 1914, \$137.00, miscellaneous expenses, annual meeting, 1914, \$9.65, annual meeting, 1915 (printing, and distribution of programmes), \$53.37, miscellaneous printing and stationery, \$57.70, supplies of all kinds (dictaphone, records for dictaphone, typewriter, etc.), \$74.88, for rebates to local classical associations (1913-1914 account, \$16.00, 1914-1915 account, \$88.00), \$104.00, travelling expenses, \$56.40, telephone and telegraph service, exchange and expressage, \$5.46, bills from Vice-Presidents, postage, 1913-1914, \$8.80, half cost of circulars in joint interests of New York Latin Club and the C. A. A. S., \$10.86, clerical assistance, \$253.25 (partly on 1913-1914 account, too), postage (miscellaneous items, from day to day, \$28.57, special items (sending out bills, or circulars in the interest of the Association, \$62.13), \$90.70, transferred to THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY, subscriptions for members, \$704.00, special publication expenses (two pamphlets, The Practical Value of Latin, and Professor Cooper's paper, printing, circulars to advertise the pamphlets, freight on the pamphlets from Geneva, N. Y., and postage on copies to all members), \$212.65, miscellaneous, \$4.00; total, \$1782.72. Balance, May 1, 1915, \$361.55. The decrease in the balance from April 11, 1914, is more than accounted for by the special expenses connected with the publication of the two pamphlets.

On April 11, 1914, the balance in the treasury of THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY was \$862.34. The receipts were: from the C. A. A. S., for members' subscriptions to THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY, \$704.00, for subscriptions, \$738.30, from miscellaneous sources (including advertising), \$815.77: total, \$3120.41. The expenditures of every sort were \$2153.01. Balance, May 1, 1915, \$967.40.

During the year the sum of \$250.54 was sent to The University of Chicago Press for subscriptions to The Classical Journal and Classical Philology. The figures on this account for the last three years are \$243.88, 238.88, 250.54, covering subscriptions as follows: The Classical Journal, 128, 132, 147, Classical Philology, 70, 64, 62.

The total membership on April 30 was 704: reported a year ago, 683. The membership as reported at the last four annual meetings has been as follows: 497, 575, 683, 704. The number of subscribers on April 30 was 715. The figures here for the last four years are 430, 558, 630, 715. The total number of paid subscriptions to THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY (members plus subscribers) has been 933, 1133, 1313, 1419.

The following resolutions, offered by the Committee on Resolutions, David M. Robinson and H. L. Crosby, were unanimously adopted:

Resolved, that The Classical Association of the Atlantic States desires to express its grateful appreciation of the most cordial hospitality with which it has been received at Swarthmore College, and in particular to thank President Swain and the Board of Managers for the use of Parrish Hall, of the Dormitories and of the Dining Room, President and Mrs. Swain again for the delightful reception in the Library, and for their hospitable entertainment on that occasion. The Association desires especially to express its sincere gratitude to Professor Walter Dennison and to the young ladies and men who assisted him, for the completeness of the arrangements made by them to secure the comfort and convenience of members and visitors, to the men and women students who so kindly vacated their rooms in the dormitories, to the readers of the papers and to Miss Loughren and to Mr. Miles, for the beautiful rendition of the 8th Ode of the first book of Horace, and to the Secretary-Treasurer, who has continued his efficient service during the past year and has arranged such a profitable and enjoyable program.

The following officers were elected (the Nominating Committee consisted of B. W. Mitchell, Mabel C. Hawes, and Floyd P. Johnson): President, Walter Dennison, Swarthmore College; Secretary-Treasurer, Charles Knapp, Barnard College, Columbia University; Vice-Presidents, H. H. Yeames, Hobart College, Geneva, N. Y., Catharine Saunders, Vassar College, Charles H. Breed, Lawrenceville School, Lawrenceville, N. J., Miss M. K. McNiff, Harrisburgh, Penn., Evan T. Sage, University of Pittsburgh, Margaret Garrett, Eastern High School, Baltimore, Charles S. Smith, George Washington University, D. of C., Elisha Conover, Delaware College, Newark, Delaware.

An invitation was received from the Washington Classical Club to meet in the District of Columbia next year. The invitation was referred to the Executive Committee, with power.

It is worth while to note, as early as this, that the annual meeting of 1916 will be the Tenth Annual Meeting of the Association. We should lay our plans early for a meeting as impressive as possible.

C. K.

BOOK REVIEWS

Demosthenes and the Last Days of Greek Freedom. 384-322 B. C. By A. W. Pickard-Cambridge. New York and London: G. P. Putnam's Sons (1914). Heroes of the Nations Series. Pp. xxiii+512. \$1.50.

It is now twenty-eight years since the revised edition of Arnold Schaefer's *Demosthenes und seine Zeit* was published. Butcher's little volume, *Demosthenes*, in the Classical Writers Series, was printed three years after Schaefer's great work. The histories of Meyer and Busolt have not yet reached the period of Demosthenes. Beloch has covered the whole period (Band II, 1897), but in very condensed form. Meanwhile, considerable additions have been made to our knowledge of the period through archaeology and by the studies called out by the discovery of the Didymus Commentary (published in 1904). Moreover, German scholars, and their English and American followers to some extent, have been inclined to abandon the traditional attitude

toward the Athenian struggle against Macedon, and to see in Isocrates, not Demosthenes, the real statesman of the time. It is perhaps not altogether fanciful to regard this changed attitude as in part resulting from the marvelous success of the New Germany, freed from the particularism of the old states, and united under the militarism and imperialism of the Prussian monarchy. Whatever the cause of the new attitude, it comes more and more insistently as a challenge to those who, following Grote and Schaefer, look upon Demosthenes as the champion of a wise and glorious struggle for national independence. It is certainly time for a new 'life' of Demosthenes to embody the results of scattered detailed studies, and to take account of the modern attitude toward his policies. We have two works of the first quality from the Macedonian standpoint, Hogarth's *Philip and Alexander of Macedon* (1897) and Wheeler's *Alexander the Great* (1900). From the Athenian standpoint Professor Pickard-Cambridge now gives us his *Demosthenes*, a volume of sufficient size to permit a much more detailed treatment than Butcher could give in his little book, yet making no pretense to the exhaustive treatment of Schaefer's work. The author had already done useful service in his excellent translations of the *Public Orations of Demosthenes* (2 volumes, Oxford, 1912). His new work shows a competent grasp of the sources, and familiarity with the recent special studies bearing on the period. In Phocian matters only he seems not to have made as much use as he might have done of archaeological material; the work at Delphi has given some new information.

Professor Pickard-Cambridge writes from the original sources, he shows excellent judgment in his estimate of recent theories (he is not at all carried away by the current Isocrates cult), and he has most diligently collected and combined the scattered material of a period where we have no contemporary historian, and where we must make large use of the contradictory statements of rival politicians, neither of whom could establish a character for truth and veracity in any court that knew them. In notes at the end of the chapters the author discusses in detail some of the more difficult questions and gives the needed references. A long chapter (41-70) gives a summary of Greek history from 404 to 359 B. C., and the next chapter, 37 pages, describes political institutions and the practical politics of the Athenian State of the fourth century. There is an excellent colored map of Greece, which secures clearness by marking for the most part only the localities that are mentioned in the text, and a clear sketch-map of the localities of the Chaeronea campaign, as well as a chart of the battle of Chaeronea, based on the new studies of Kromayer. The author has prepared a very full chronological table, embodying the results of the latest research; it will properly supersede Schaefer's table so far as it covers the same events. The text is illustrated with more than a score of excellent plates. The most valuable among these are the photograph of the Vati-

can statue of Demosthenes (with the clasped hands recently discovered, in place of the modern hands with the roll), and the photograph of the Lion of Chaeronea. A good many of the plates have no very close connection with the text, and one could wish that the author had given us some that are less accessible rather than these stock photographs. We need more of the landscapes; we should welcome some views of the Macedonian country, and of those regions of the Chalcidic peninsula and Thrace that figure so largely in the narrative. The views of Delphi are always interesting, but for this book the one necessary view, the plain and harbor as seen from the heights, is lacking. A photograph of the priceless inscription that records the constitution of the Second Athenian Confederacy, with a translation of it, might well take the place of the view of the temple of Hera at Olympia, which is supposed to illustrate the "success of his <Philip's> force in the Olympian games" (we may guess that we owe "force" to a careless proof reader; "horse" would be a safe emendation).

The first thing to say of the book as a whole is that it is sound and reliable. The author has done an immense amount of patient critical work in gathering and sifting his material, and weighing the often conflicting judgments that scholars have passed upon it. It is a book to be trusted in general in its statement of facts. The author is at his best in following out the successive steps in a complicated series; he likes to give all the details, to name all the actors and the places. This makes his book excellent for reference, but less attractive to the general reader. The picture of any one part of the author's field lacks perspective; the great events are sometimes obscured by the multiplicity of the little ones. The author is not keen in discerning the need of the reader for interpretation of situations and events; he does sometimes give the large view of a situation and point out the significance of a movement, but such interpretation is infrequent. This defect is particularly unfortunate in the description of the career of a man like Philip, whose activities passed so rapidly from one locality to another, but always with such far-seeing judgment. The reader finds here no such interpretation as that which makes Hogarth's Philip such a fascinating character. There is a lack, too, of the geographical interpretation that is needed at every step to make clear the strategy of Philip's steady advance. As we read Hogarth we see each movement as caused and conditioned by the physical environment of Philip's home-land; and we see for what reasons and to what degree the conflict with Athens was inevitable, if Philip was to realize a legitimate ambition for a place for Macedon 'in the sun'. In Mr. Pickard-Cambridge's narrative these aspects are not ignored, but they do not receive the constant attention that they ought to have.

Three fundamental questions confront the modern student of the activity of Demosthenes as a statesman. First, was the struggle against Philip a hopeless one?

Mr. Pickard-Cambridge, although he gives a most discouraging picture of the Athens of Demosthenes's time, holds that Athens and her allies did come near enough to success to justify the struggle. He accepts, too, Demosthenes's own proud confession of faith in liberty, his *παράδοξόν τι*, and by quoting that great passage of the Crown Speech (*εἰ γὰρ ἦν ἅπασι πρόβλημα τὰ μέλλοντα γενέσθαι . . . οὐδ' οὕτως ἀποστατέον τῇ πόλει τούτων ἢ, εἴπερ ἡ δόξῃς ἢ προγόνων ἢ τοῦ μέλλοντος αἰῶνος εἴχε λόγον*) he gives to his reader the fundamental defense of Demosthenes's aims from the Athenian standpoint. But the modern critics of Demosthenes raise a more serious question: Was it not for the interest of the Greek states as a whole to be forced to relinquish their endless wars with one another and be united under a strong central power?—the argument of the admirer of united, Prussianized Germany. This question is not clearly faced in this volume; and yet it is fundamental. To answer it the author would have been compelled to sketch the history of the Greek states in the generation after Alexander. No one can intelligently estimate the Hellenic bearing of Demosthenes's policies until he has followed out the tale of misery of those later years, when Greece found neither union nor peace nor honor in the midst of the warring claimants to the Macedonian throne. The reader of Ferguson's Hellenistic Athens will endorse Swoboda's statement of the final impression that that great book leaves with the student:

Der allgemeine Eindruck den es hinterlässt stimmt allerdings zu der bisherigen Auffassung, nach welcher der Schwerpunkt in der Entwicklung des Hellenismus nicht auf den einzelnen Gemeinden beruhte, mögen sie noch bedeutend gewesen sein wie Athen sondern auf den Persönlichkeiten der Herrscher.

A 'life' of Demosthenes should include not only a sketch of the events of the generation that preceded him, out of which his activities grew, but also an equally clear sketch of the fate of the generation that followed him, experiencing the natural fruits of the supremacy of the Macedonian war-lords. In no other way will the reader be able to appreciate the unsoundness of much of the modern criticism of Demosthenes's policies. The new 'life', closing as it does with the death of Demosthenes, affords no understanding of this important phase of the study. And we cannot say either that a biographer of Demosthenes has surveyed the whole field who has not fairly met the third question of modern critics: Was not the struggle for the continued independence of the Hellenic states really a struggle against the grand march of civilization that was to open a new world to Greek culture, and give supremacy to the Greek genius? An author who finds a place for Euryzelmis and Cotys and Berisades and Amadocus of Thrace should find room for at least the stating of a question like this.

There is another surprising gap in this new life of Demosthenes: there is in it no adequate account of Demosthenes the orator. It is the statesman that

interests Mr. Pickard-Cambridge. He gives considerable attention to the argument of the successive speeches and considerable quotations from them (he assumes also that his two volumes of translation will be in the hands of his readers); he incidentally gives some idea of the oratorical character of one speech and another, but there is no chapter devoted to a summing up of the characteristics of Demosthenes's oratory, no detailed illustration of the composition of his great periods, of the range of his invention in argument, and his protean variety of expression, no adequate account of the marvelous laws of his composition. Some attention is given to this phase of his work in the chapter on the Youth and Training of Demosthenes, but in the concluding chapter of the book, where we should expect the detailed treatment, a foot-note refers us to "a brief appreciation of the character of Demosthenes as an orator" in the author's introduction to his translation of the public speeches—a scant five pages of most general statements, not to be compared with Butcher's summary.

In the brilliant essay, *Clio*, a Muse, which gives the title to the recent volume of George Trevelyan's essays, we have this clear-cut statement of the requirements for a piece of historical writing (30 ff.):

. . . there are three distinct functions of history that we may call the *scientific*, the *imaginative* or *speculative*, and the *literary*. First comes what we may call the *scientific*, if we confine the word to this narrow but vital function, the day-labour that every historian must well and truly perform if he is to be a serious member of his profession—the accumulation of facts and the sifting of evidence. . . . Then comes the *imaginative* or *speculative*, when he plays with the facts that he has gathered, selects and classifies them, and makes his guesses and generalizations. And last but not least comes the *literary* function, the exposition of the results of science and imagination in a form that will attract and educate our fellow-countrymen.

Applying Trevelyan's tests to the book under review, we may say unhesitatingly that the work is scientific; the evidence is well collected and sifted. On the imaginative and speculative side also the work is well done, though it would greatly help the reader to be allowed more fully to share the author's mental processes in his interpretation of facts. But it must be said that the literary function has been neglected. It is not in general an attractive narrative: overburdened with details, often lacking in interpretation of events, almost wholly lacking in vivid or picturesque presentation of the striking scenes in which it moves, and sometimes even careless in expression, it makes little appeal as a piece of literature. The author does not fulfil the promise of the advertising page at the back of the volume, in which we are told that in the Heroes of the Nations Series the narrative "will present picturesque and dramatic stories of the men and of the events connected with them". This narrative is reliable, but it is neither picturesque nor dramatic. It is not, therefore, a work to be given as

a whole to the general reader or the young student. For such a reader Hogarth's Philip and Butcher's little book are still the best introduction to the life of Demosthenes. This book is for the mature and serious student, and for him it will be of very great value.

DARTMOUTH COLLEGE.

CHARLES D. ADAMS.

The Origin of Attic Comedy. By F. M. Cornford. London: Edward Arnold; New York: Longmans, Green, and Co. (1914). Pp. xii + 252. \$2.40 net.

The present reviewer is free to confess that he took up this book with a distinct prejudice. Mr. Cornford belongs to a group of English classicists the brilliance of whose scholarship is second only to their intrepidity. Much as Mr. Gilbert Murray, Miss Jane Harrison, Professor William Ridgeway, and the rest may differ in other respects, they agree in seeking light upon classical problems from anthropological lore and in sticking at no exegesis which will contribute to this happy consummation. Then, when I read in the first paragraph of Mr. Cornford's Preface that "the constant features of the Aristophanic play were inherited from a ritual drama" and recalled how disingenuously the same author, in his Thucydides Mythistoricus, had resolved the three appearances of Cleon on that historian's pages into "the complete outline of a drama", my misgivings did not lessen. If I add that with further reading my prejudice against Mr. Cornford's volume has vanished, I must not be understood as accepting to any great extent his conclusions. But with the exception of his statement that "it is tempting to see in the two half-choruses of twelve in Attic Comedy, the twelve months of the Old and the New Years" (p. 129, n. 2), Mr. Cornford rides his anthropological hobbyhorse with comparative discretion. In fact this is the only utterly preposterous suggestion that I have noted. Of still greater consequence than the sober application of his viewpoint, however, is the fact that there is a certain factor which differentiates the origin of comedy from most other studies in origins.

This factor is brought out in Aristotle's statement that "comedy originated with the leaders of the phallic ceremonies, *which still survive as institutions in many of our cities*". Mr. Cornford finds the best illustration of these ceremonies in Aristophanes, *Acharn.* 241 ff., and concludes from this and other evidence that the phallic rites had a double object—that they were both a "positive agent of fertilization" and a "negative charm against evil spirits". The former result was obtained by the invocation of friendly powers: as to the latter,

the simplest of all methods of expelling such malign influences of any kind is to abuse them with the most violent language. No distinction is drawn between this and the custom of abusing, and even beating, the persons or things which are to be rid of them . . . There can be no doubt that the element of invective and personal satire which distinguishes the Old Comedy is directly descended from the magical abuse of the

phallic procession, just as its obscenity is due to the sexual magic; and it is likely that this ritual justification was well known to an audience familiar with the phallic ceremony itself.

I believe these quotations to represent sound conclusions. Now, if the phallic ceremonies continued until Aristotle's day and if their connection with comedy had always been recognized, the hypothesis that comedy always harked back to this primitive ritual is not so fantastic as it would otherwise be. In my opinion, our author is correct also in tracing the agon and the parabasis of Old Comedy, as well as its physical violence and horseplay, back to the magical aversion of evil in the phallic rites. I regret to state that, with minor exceptions, this marks the limit of the concessions I can make to Mr. Cornford's views.

Writers on the origin of Attic comedy are fairly well agreed upon one point, that only some features of it are indigenous and that it has been greatly modified by importations from Sicily and the Peloponnesus. But, when they undertake to separate the foreign and the native elements, concord flies out of the window. Yet even this single point of unanimity is unacceptable to Mr. Cornford, who maintains that every part of Old Comedy is Attic and would reduce the Dorian influence to a minimum. He acknowledges adherence to Professor Murray's theory concerning the origin of tragedy and constructs a very similar hypothesis, *mutatis mutandis*, for comedy. Comedy, then, was derived from sympathetic magic, from "the fertility drama of the marriage of the Old Year transformed into the New". Every year a stereotyped series of incidents was repeated. The ritual began with an agon between the good principle and the bad principle (the New Year versus the Old, Summer versus Winter, Life versus Death, etc.), was continued either by the defeat and death of the latter, followed by a sacrifice and feast of thanksgiving; or by the death of the former, who was slain, dismembered, cooked, and eaten in the communal feast, only to be triumphantly resurrected. In either case, the festivities are interrupted by a succession of "unwelcome intruders" consisting of stock characters like the buffoon, the doctor or cook, the soldier, the old man, the old woman, etc. These are just the characters that are required for the fixed plot of the fertility drama. Finally, in the exodus occurs a "sacred marriage" (together with a *comus* song and procession), derived from a sexual union which originally was consummated, or feigned, in order that all the natural powers of fertility might be stimulated to perform their function. The regular series of incidents, as outlined, forms the framework of Aristophanes's eleven plays, however diverse their themes. At first blush this statement must appear absolutely incredible to every reader, but Mr. Cornford displays the most amazing ingenuity in maintaining it.

Tragedy and comedy, he continues, have both come from a ritual drama which was "the same in type and

content, though not necessarily performed at the same time of the year". They differ in that, whereas comedy retains the whole series of canonical incidents, the Aeschylean trilogy stops with the happy ending of the hero's resurrection, the series being concluded by the satyric drama. These conventional features are what Aristotle had in mind when he declared that comedy 'already had certain definite forms when the record of its poets begins'.

All criticism implies the existence of some standard of comparison, in this case the possibility of pointing out, or of establishing for one's self, a more satisfactory hypothesis. The latter alternative I intend to avail myself of in a forthcoming book on the Greek Theater and its Drama; accordingly, there is the less need of indulging in constructive criticism here. Nevertheless, I entertain no false hopes of setting up unassailable results. The evidence at hand is too scanty for that. Mr. Cornford truly remarks (p. 220):

Many literary critics seem to think that an hypothesis about obscure and remote questions of history can be refuted by a simple demand for the production of more evidence than in fact exists. The demand is as easy to make as it is impossible to satisfy. But the true test of an hypothesis, if it cannot be shown to conflict with known truths, is the number of facts that it correlates and explains. The question left for the reader's consideration is whether, after following our argument, he understands better the form and features of this strange phenomenon, Aristophanic Comedy.

The fact is that, if the true development of Greek drama were divinely revealed to some one, he would be unable to formulate a cogent proof for it. Notwithstanding, in spite of these considerations and without deprecating the value of anthropological parallels, it is still possible to comment in all fairness upon certain features of Mr. Cornford's conclusions.

Pages 3-7 deal with some current theories of the origin of comedy. It is unfortunate that Mr. Cornford is apparently unacquainted with the two latest attempts, except his own, to treat the subject. I refer to Professor Capps's paper in *Lectures on Greek Literature* (1912), 124 ff., and Professor Navarre's paper in *Revue des Études anciennes*, 1911, 245 ff. These authorities closely agree in their results and differentiate Attic and Dorian influences most sensibly.

Page 32. For the interpretation of Aristophanes's *Ranae* 790 compare *Transactions of the American Philological Association* 40. 93 ff.

P. 36. For Aristotle's *Poetics* 1449a 37 ff. Mr. Cornford should consult Professor Capps, in the *University of Chicago Decennial Publications*, Volume 6, especially pages 266 ff. Professor Capps made it seem very clear that *πρόσωπα*, prologues, and a plurality of actors were introduced after 487 B. C., not before. Moreover, he has informed me by letter that he believes *πρόσωπα* in this passage to mean not 'masks' but 'characters'. All this has a direct bearing upon Mr. Corn-

ford's argument. Our author is troubled because, though the contents of epirrheme and antepirrheme in the parabasis are "iambic" (i. e. lampooning), the meter is not iambic. But iambic meter was invented by Archilochus, while the magical abuse of the phallic ceremonies must have started centuries before.

Pages 51 and 183. The first actor in comedy, Mr. Cornford argues, was a projection of the vaguely personified genius of the Phallic rites, Phales. But in my opinion this would place the introduction of actors at far too early a date. See the preceding note.

Pages 62 ff. Mr. Cornford makes the North Greece carnivals progenitors of comedy, as Ridgeway and others have made them the prototype of tragedy. But, since Mr. Cornford postulates practically the same source for both tragedy and comedy (compare pages 68, 190, 195, 246, etc.), the disagreement is only apparent. If the premises be granted, the original identity of tragedy and comedy logically follows. So irrational a result ought to open our eyes to the fact that arguments drawn from sympathetic magic cannot be unreservedly traced to their utmost implications. The ancient equation *τραγῷδια* = *τρυγῷδια* was due to a false etymology, and its modern analogue is equally impossible. The present-day carnivals are too full of later accretions to be safely employed as evidence for the sixth century B. C. and earlier; against the possibility of tragedy springing from them still stronger objections lie (see *Classical Philology* 8. 282 ff.). Furthermore, the contention (246) that tragedy and satyric drama divided between them the ritual outlines which comedy preserved in their entirety must give us pause. What has become of the "choral agon" (the parabasis) in the division? And what convincing traces of a "sacred marriage" do Euripides's *Cyclops* and Sophocles's *Ichneutae* afford? I have too great respect for Mr. Cornford's ingenuity to assert that none can be found, but at least they are not at once discernible to the anthropologically unsophisticated.

Pages 67 f. Mr. Cornford accepts Farnell's derivation of tragedy from the worship of Dionysus of the Black Goatskin and from the duel between Xanthus and Melanthus. Compare my criticism of this theory in *Classical Philology* 8. 270.

Page 89. "The legends ultimately based on this ritual, the stories of Pelops, Pelias, Aeson, and the rest, have come down to us in forms which date from a time when their original meaning had been forgotten". I suppose this holds true also of the myths of Oedipus, Perseus and Andromeda, Heracles and Hesione, and Pentheus, which are the outgrowth of the same fertility ritual (58 and 66). Now, so far as fifth century dramatists treated these themes, they helped to fix the forms in which these stories "have come down to us". Consequently, according to Mr. Cornford's own admission, the "original meaning" of these had already been lost sight of at that period. Similarly,

Mr. Cornford says that tragedy borrowed from heroic legends such stories as illustrate the fundamental conception of the old ritual plot, which explains Aristotle's statement "that 'Tragedies are restricted to a small number of (heroic) families . . . in which such horrors have occurred', but he could not know the reason" (p. 211 and n.). The words which I have italicized in these two quotations are a necessary concession; but, as has already been pointed out in the second paragraph of this review, they relinquish the only consideration that could make Mr. Cornford's argument plausible. If so much can not be postulated for any part of his argument, that part is seriously impaired. It is partly because this *can* be postulated for the physical violence and obscenity of Old Comedy that I am willing to accept Mr. Cornford's reasoning at that point. Now, if Aristotle knew nothing of the ritual plot, neither did fourth century playwrights; and we have just seen that fifth century tragedians were equally ignorant. It follows that, if Aeschylus and Euripides when dramatizing the Pentheus myth, for example, were no more conscious of dependence upon a ritual plot than was Marlowe in writing *Doctor Faustus*, the influence of primitive ritual upon mature tragedy must have been nonexistent or negligible. Then the question takes another form—did the tragic poets *unconsciously* follow a fixed series of incidents? When this notion leads Mr. Cornford to allege that the agon between Admetus and Pheres in Euripides's *Alcestis* is "barely intelligible except in the light of the old ritual conflict of the Young King claiming to supersede the outworn Old King" (p. 78), I for one am not impressed.

In comedy he fares no better: compare the suggestion that in Aristophanes's *Frogs* Euripides's complaint at being 'left for dead' in the underworld "gains point if we suppose a reminiscence that such had originally been the Antagonist's fate" (82). Mr. Cornford is constantly insisting that the strength of his arguments rests in its cumulative effect. But when this arises from such details as these, one's faith grows less rather than greater. Upon comedy, however, our author evidently believes the fixed plot of primitive ritual to have exercised a conscious influence. Such an unchanging plot would naturally result in a set of stock characters. Therefore, the heroes of comedy—"especially certain very important ones, who bear historical names—are made to wear one or another of a definite set of stock masks. They are, to the almost complete sacrifice of realistic portraiture, conformed to the traditional traits of these masks" (154). *Lamachus* and *Aeschylus* (!) are adaptations of the *Miles Gloriosus*, *Socrates* and Euripides of the *Learned Doctor*, *Agoracritus* of the *Cook*, *Cleon* of the *Parasite*, etc. All this implies conscious adaptation on the part of the comic poet and perfect understanding by the public of what he was doing. Now is it conceivable that *Cleon* would have been so stung by Aristophanes's attacks and

that *Socrates* in the *Apology* could have attributed to the *Clouds* so much of the feeling against him, if every one had known that Aristophanes, like another *Procrustes*, was merely forcing his contemporaries to lie in the places of conventionalized, stock characters? The exigencies of this argument compel Mr. Cornford to maintain (168) that of all the historical characters in comedy "the only one represented by anything like a recognizable portrait is *Cleon*" (!). Of course, he has to grant that "it is just in this case that Aristophanes explicitly says that the mask worn by the actor was not a portrait of the demagogue's real features". He tries to break the force of so damning a statement by alleging that "the excuse that no costumer could be found who was willing to make anything so terrific as a portrait-mask of *Cleon*, is a joke and not to be taken literally". But "so terrific" here is due to a misinterpretation of Aristophanes, for *ὅτι τοῦ δέους* refers to fear of *Cleon's* vengeance. With this correction the "joke" disappears, and the whole argument collapses.

Pages 100-102. Mr. Cornford considers the scattering of sweetmeats to the spectators in Old Comedy to be a survival of the communal meal. I venture to believe that I gave a simpler explanation, and all that is required, at Iowa City last spring; compare *The Classical Journal* 10.212 f.

Page 217. *Ἀτάκτως* in Tzetzes does not, I believe, mean "without orderly arrangement", but "in an undifferentiated crowd". In note 1 more of Tzetzes's text ought to be quoted.

Despite my inability to accept the major part of Mr. Cornford's theories, including his two main theses that Attic comedy was entirely indigenous and that Old Comedy closely followed the outlines of a ritual plot, I concede that he has written a valuable and stimulating work, one that will repay careful study and will add permanently to its author's reputation. It abounds in shrewd deductions and subtle observations. I regret that the length to which this review has already attained will prevent my citing any of these. The style and presentation are so attractive as scarcely to permit one to lay the volume down before the last page is reached.

NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY.

ROY C. FLICKINGER.

Livy. Books I, XXI, and XXII. Edited with brief Introduction and Commentary and Numerous Illustrations by Emory B. Lease. Boston: D. C. Heath and Company (1914). Pp. xl + 352.

This new edition of Professor Lease's *Livy* is well described in the Preface as a revised edition, for much of the material of the first edition (1905) has been recast, later returns have changed some of the statistical totals, while in other cases there are distinctly honorable omissions. The editor's justification of a new edition lies in numerous requests to him "to meet the needs of the less advanced student". The broader features of the first edition are retained, with altered proportions. Instead of the 72 pages of Introduction, 38 now suffice, and they appear in greatly improved form. In

the subject-matter retained, some statements have been altered, and even some additions made. The wholly improbable surmise "that Livy intended to extend his history to 150 books and to close with the death of Augustus" is unfortunately repeated (xi). Eight books would seem too scant to cover, with all the fullness of contemporary history, the events from 9 B. C. to 14 A. D., and the plan could not have been intelligently made until the aged Livy was sure he would outlive the aged Augustus. The text of the two editions is identical, except that now and then an obviously necessary, or desirable, change was mechanically possible (for example, p. 4, l. 34, *factam* for *factum*; in l. 1503, *cum* is adopted, *<ut>* deleted). A slightly changed list of Selections is offered, presumably that those who desire may take what they need from the fountain without risking the river's fullness. The Commentary is reduced from 237 to 173 pages; yet a number of excellent additions receive space, such as Canon Roberts's translation of Livy's Praefatio, summaries of Books II-XX and XXIII-XXX, interesting notes on The Later History of Hannibal and The Later History of Carthage, and a scant page of Loci Memoriales. One is a little startled in the summary of the second decade to find that certain portions "are devoted" to certain topics, certain wars "are described", and that Book XX "closes with", etc. Perhaps the less advanced student will remember the facts from the Introduction, and perceive that here the editor possesses a vivid style rather than some of the lost books, but I doubt it.

The changes in the Commentary are after all the most significant thing. Here for the purpose in view Professor Lease has made excellent changes. Many errors of reference have been eliminated, cross-references have been reduced, and the bibliography brought thoroughly up to date. As the editor himself might put it, the new edition has in up-to-date professional literature 12 new references for Book I, 8 for XXI, and 5 for XXII. Sixteen new folklore references on Book I are added, 7 being from Frazer's *Golden Bough*; one new historical foot-note is given for XXI, and three new folklore references are found on XXII. Eight new references to standard English literature are found, but I frankly do not understand the purpose of referring to Emerson on I. 600. Emerson has no discussion of metempsychosis and the reference, an allusion to an allusion, does not point a moral though it may adorn the note.

Professor Lease's industry in the field of statistical syntax is well known at home, and has had recognition abroad by Schmalz and other discriminating scholars. He himself has defended the statistical features of his first edition (*The Classical Journal* i. 197). Perhaps it was too much to expect that the "less advanced student" should be supposed by the editor to have little interest, real or possible, in such matters. If the purpose of a freshman in reading Livy were the same as that of a specialist, only commendation should be offered. It is true that some of the freshmen may become intelligent specialists, but often characteristics and tendencies would suffice without details. To illustrate, one might say that now and then there is a monotony of phrase in Professor Lease's English, without citing (Catullus) "Rome's great lyric poet" . . . (Vergil) "Rome's great epic poet" (page ix); (Quintilian) "Rome's great rhetorician" (xiv, n.3; xvi, §9); (Regulus, one of) "Rome's great heroes" (243); (Paulus, one of) "Rome's great men" (XXII. 1631, n.); (Carthage) "Rome's great rival" (348), or without reckoning the total

and recording that the locution seems first to occur, in the editor at least, in his study of "Prudentius, Rome's great Christian poet". Such statements or statistics would be gratuitous. Just so a freshman is not likely to profit much by learning that *adorati*, "used of the worship of the gods, is found first in poetry in Laevius (*flor.* 100 B. C.) and in Vergil, first in prose in Livy" (XXI. 464, n.). Why rescue insignificant Laevius? Besides, Laevius used not *adorati* but *adorans* (or was it after all, as Bachrens suggested, *adornans*?), and the student must still await information as to who, first used the passive. The "less advanced student" will often wonder if his needs have been constantly in mind. Certainly the point of view shifts. At one time the notes explain in lowest terms who "Dionysius Hal." was (xv, n. 4, though this is not the first reference to Dionysius); at another time, the difference between *rēgi* and *rēgi* is asked for (on I. 157, where *rēgi* could not be translated); presently *exquilinus* and *inquilinus* are cited in explanation of *Esquilias* (I. 1586); and again we have Nepotian (XXI. 1931), Zonaras (XXII. 1480), Claudian (XXII. 2119), Laevius (XXI. 464) and C. I. L. (XXII. 896, 1095). Nothing is gained for a freshman by explaining that Gronovius and Madvig are respectively responsible for the conjectured *e* (XXI. 1694), and *a* (XXII. 1178). But, by any standard, there is occasional unevenness. If at I. 78 Mr. Ashby's special article on Monte Cavo is to be cited, one might reasonably expect a reference to Miss Taylor's monograph on Ostia at I. 1234. Its historical introduction especially would be in point. And, since reference is made to the Chinese Hou Chi (page 188, n. 1), the Indian Gunādhyā (235, n. 1), and Sampson's foxes (XXII. 586), why forget Lot's wife on *respicere vetitus* (XXI. 649), not to mention Orpheus? Professor Lease does not often err in the matter of omissions, but at I. 1199 an explanation of the legal fiction involved in throwing a spear into a plot of ground near Rome should have been given; and better notes on *venando* (I. 129), *equites legendo* (XXI. 1626), and *ab lergoque* (XXII. 1005) have evidently been repressed.

In the by no means easy matter of using clear, concise and pithy English there is a distinct improvement. But occasional lapses have been noted: "When everybody has been *whipped*" (I. 640); "Mommisen *sides with* Livy" (XXI. 1919); "*Each . . . was ready to surrender their . . . guest*" (347); "There later stood the temple of Veiovis, and today the Piazza del Campidoglio" (I. 268; a parallel would be at I. 195, "The Romans celebrated April 21st as the 'birthday' of Rome", if one added 'and to-day'); "Hannibal: the greatest general ever lived", parallel with the "second Punic War: the greatest ever fought" (page 350, n. 1); the translation "*roll yourself down*" for *devolvere* (I. 1687); and brevity at least is not a consideration in the review question, "When did Scipio, the victor at Zama, first step upon the stage of the world's history?" (351).

Misprints, comparatively speaking, have disappeared. But in many cases the notes, while ostensibly on lines, are really on sections and all references to books other than those annotated are necessarily in 'Old Style', so that, with this confusion, I doubt any real gain in emulating Gruter's fame.

The typography of the book is vastly improved, and many new illustrations add their share of interest.

On the whole, in spite of certain defects, Professor Lease has undoubtedly produced a significant edition of Livy, one that is both intelligently conceived and diligently worked out. In point of real contribution its high merits cannot for a moment be questioned.

NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY.

O. F. LONG.

INDEX¹

	PAGE		PAGE
Abbott's Roman Political Institutions (Knapp)	64	Classical Associations—Contd.	
Abbott, L.: The Value of Latin	8	New York State	136
Ab Urbe Domum, Helen C. Crew	106-108	New York State Teachers'	47, 87-88
Adams, C. D.: see Reviews, Pickard-Cambridge		Philadelphia	56, 128, 152, 191-192
Alcestis in English, H. H. Yeames	176	Philadelphia Society for the Promotion of	
Alexander, L.: The Kings of Lydia (Kent)	207-208	Liberal Studies	61, 62, 135, 160, 168, 191
Allen, C. S.: Liberal Study	144	Pittsburgh	55, 95, 184
Allen, W. F. A. and Katharine and Hendrickson, G. L.: Tacitus, Agricola and Germania (Kellogg)	215-216	Societas Gentium Latina	184
America, Latin Version of, G. D. Kellogg	7	Syracuse Central High School	23-24
Another 'New' Thing that is Old, F. P. Johnson	112	Upper Hudson	55-56
Austin, C. R.: One Way to Teach Latin	4-5	Washington	144
Baker, Emilie K.: Stories of Old Greece and Rome (Goodale)	16	Classical Conferences:	
Barss, J. E.: Writing Latin: Book Two (Rockwood)	176	At Clinton, N. Y.	183-184
Baur, P. V. C.: see Reviews, Waldstein		At College of the City of New York	48, 55, 72
Bennett, C. E.: The Syntax of Early Latin. Vol. II—The Cases (Wheeler)	213-215	At Harrisburg	112
Bice, H. H.: Sight Reading (Mitchell)	143	Class-Room and the Telegraphic News,	
Book Notices	16, 64	Olivia M. Pound	96
Botsford, G. W.: see Reviews, Weigall		Cleasby, H. L.: see Reviews, O'Brien	
Bouchier, E. S.: Spain under the Roman Empire (Clark)	134-135	Code, G. N.: When the Fates Decree (Henry)	6-7
Brackets, H. D.: A Question of Values in the Study of Greek	138-141	Collins, J. C.: Greek Influence on English Poetry (Van Hook)	125-127
Bradley, B. W.: School Editions of the Classics	18-20	Conservation of Natural Resources in the Roman Republic, E. T. Sage	58-61
Breed, C. H.: Latin Composition in Secondary Schools	203-204	Cooper, Lane: The Teaching of English and the Study of the Classics	178-182
Brewer, F. E.: see Reviews, Janes		Cornford, F. M.: The Origin of Attic Comedy (Flickinger)	221-223
Brooks, A. M.: Architecture and the Allied Arts (Hamlin)	151-152	Crawford, J. R.: A Summary of Recent Activities on the Palatine	20-22
Bryce, J.: The Value of the Classics	80	Crew, Helen C.: Ab Urbe Domum	106-108
Burchett, B. R.: The Divine Character of the Rex Sacrorum	33-37	Cupids, House of the Gilded, E. H. Haight	37-38
Caesar and the War, E. Riess	128	Daniels, E. D.: Latin Drill (Harwood)	111-112
Caldwell, W. E.: The Sequence of Events after Caesar's Death	67-69	Dennison, W.: see Reviews, Magoffin	
Calhoun, G. M.: Athenian Clubs (Carroll)	159-160	Deutsch, M. E.: Latin Instruction in California Intermediate Schools	122-125
Campbell, S. G.: Livy, XXVII (Lease)	127-128	Dido: A Latin Play	170, 200
Capps, E.: see Reviews, Earle		Direct Method and its Application to the Classical Languages, T. S. Tyng	186-190, 194-199
Captives of Plautus, acted at Mt. Holyoke College	224	Donnelly, F. P.: A Greek Schoolmaster Still Teaching	132-133
Carroll, M.: see Reviews, Calhoun		Douglas, S. O. G.: A Theory of Civilization, (Magoffin)	117-118
Chickering, Edward C. and Hoadley, Harwood, Beginner's Latin (Foster)	199-200	Duncan, T. S.: Art in Status (Lipscomb)	167-168
Clark, A. C.: Recent Developments in Textual Criticism (Clark)	118-119	Earle, M. L.: Classical Papers of (Capps)	38-40
Clark, C. U.: see Reviews, Bouchier, Clark		Editorials:	
Classical Articles in Non-Classical Periodicals	47-48, 95, 120, 128, 152, 192	By Charles Knapp:	
Classical Associations:		The Aeneid as a Tragedy: Dido, A Latin Tragedy	169-170
American Philological	24	An Analysis of Cicero, Cato Maior	177-178, 185-186
Atlantic States	144	A Bronze Statue of a Boy, etc.	105-106
Baltimore	95	The C. A. A. S. and its Members	1-2
Chemung County	24	Ninth Annual Meeting of The C. A. A. S.	217-218
Erie County	192	Tenth Annual Meeting of The Classical Association of New England	193-194
Latin Club of Wadleigh High School	128	Classical Departments and the Classics	17-18
Latin Journal Club of Vassar College	192	The Classical Student and Topographical and Geological Studies	89-90, 97-98
Monroe County	136	Classics and the Teaching of English	49-50
New York Latin Club 8, 32, 56, 104, 136, 143-144, 184, 200		Latin in the Small High School	129-130
		Mr. O. O. Norris on the Study of the Classics	137-138, 145-146
		Dr. A. C. Thompson on Liberal Study	81
		The University of Colorado Pamphlet on the Value of the Classics	113-115, 121-122
		On Xenophon's Anabasis	33
		Mr. John M. Zane on the Value of the Classics to the Lawyer	57-58

¹Part II of THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY, Volume VIII, No. 20, May 20, 1915. The Index and Table of Contents (Parts I and II of No. 20) are the work of Mr. William Stuart Messer, of Barnard College, Columbia University.

Editorials—Contd.	PAGE		PAGE
By Charles E. Bennett:		Keith, A. L.: Two Wars in Gaul.....	42-43
The Pronunciation of Classical Proper Names	209	Kellogg, G. D.: America, Latin Version of ..	7
By W. B. McDaniel:		See Reviews, Allen	
One Way to Stimulate Interest in the Classics	41-42	Kent, R. G.: The Military Tactics of Caesar and of To-day.....	69-70
By B. L. Ullman:		An Offering to the Manes.....	144
The European War and the Classics.....	73-74	The Plutei to the Front.....	136
Moving Pictures and the Classics.....	201-202	See Reviews, Alexander, Juret	
Egbert, J. C.: Livy, The Second Punic War (Sage)	5-6	Knapp, C.: See Editorials	
English and the Classics, Lane Cooper.....	178-182	See Book Notices.....	
Epitome Thesauri Latini.....	46	See Reviews.....	
Ferguson, J. F.: see Reviews, Reid.....		Miscellaneous Contributions.....	135, 216
Ferguson, W. S.: Hellenistic Athens (Johnson)	100-101	Lang, Andrew, Memorial to.....	32
See Reviews, Walker.....		Language Work in the Grades, H. C. Nutting	172-173
Ferrero, G.: Ancient Rome and Modern America and Between the Old World and the New (Sage).....	175-176	Latin Composition, C. H. Breed.....	203-204
Fine Arts and the Classics, W. A. Oldfather.....	65-67	Latin in Education (Colorado Pamphlet).....	56
Fitch, E.: Notice of Friedrich Leo.....	40	Latin in Ohio, W. H. Johnson.....	32
Flickinger, R. C.: see Reviews, Cornford.....		Latin in the Grades, Anna S. Jones.....	130-132
Foster, B. O.: see Reviews, Chickering.....		Latin Instruction in California Intermediate Schools, M. E. Deutsch.....	122-125
Galic Parallel, A. A. S. Pease.....	168	Latin League of Wisconsin Colleges.....	46-47
Gallup, F. A.: A Latin Reader (Mitchell).....	143	Latin, One Way to Teach, C. R. Austin.....	4-5
Gardner, P.: Greek Art (Tonks).....	14-15	Latin Play at Oakwood Seminary.....	24
Gehman, H. S.: The Use of Interpreters.....	9-14	Latin, Value of, L. Abbott.....	8
Glass, T. B.: How to Study Latin and Greek	43-45	Latin Version.....	7
Gleason, C. W.: see Reviews, Tunstall.....		Lease, E. B.: Livy, I, XXI, XXII (Long).....	
Goodale, G.: see Reviews, Baker.....		See Reviews, Campbell.....	
Gordon, G. S.: English Literature and the Classics (Van Hook).....	125-127	Ledl, A.: Studien, etc. (Olmstead).....	78-80
Grammatical Excursion, A. F. G. Moore.....	81-87	Leo, Friedrich, Notice of.....	40
Greek Poetry in English Translations, D. A. Penick	115-117	Lewis, J. H.: Two Great Republics (Sage).....	15-16
Greek Literature in English Translations, D. M. Robinson.....	153-156	Liberal Studies, etc., Katherine M. Puncheon	2-4
Greek Schoolmaster Still Teaching, F. P. Donnelly	132-133	Lipscomb, H. C.: see Reviews, Duncan.....	
Guernsey, R.: see Reviews, Murray.....		Livy, I-V, Oxford Classical Texts (Knapp).....	16
Hackforth, R.: Platonic Epistles (Shorey).....	173-174	Loeb, James: On the Value of the Classics.....	24
Haight, Elizabeth H.: The House of the Gilded Cupids.....	37-38	Long, O. F.: see Reviews, Lease.....	
Hall, Edith: see Reviews, Hall.....		Lowe, W. D.: Pliny's Letters (Messer).....	191
Hall, H. R.: Aegean Archaeology (Hall).....	190-191	McDaniel, W. B.: see Editorials.....	
Hamlin, A. D. F.: see Reviews, Brooks.....		See Reviews, Mustard, Roper	
Harcum, Cornelia: Roman Cooks (Rolfe).....	215	Magoffin, R. V. D.: The Quinquennales, An Historical Study (Dennison).....	46
Harwood, Mary E.: see Reviews, Daniels.....		See Reviews, Douglas.....	
Helm, N. W.: A Tribute to the Classics.....	96	Manatt, J. I.: Aegean Days (Robinson).....	150-151
Hendrickson, G. L.: see Allen, W. F. A.....		Medical Man and Greek, Dr. Duane on.....	7-8
Henry, N. E.: see Reviews, Code.....		Meillet, A.: Aperçu d'une histoire de la langue grecque (Sturtevant).....	45-46
Hibben, J. G.: The Value of the Classics.....	8	Messer, W. S.: see Classical Articles in Non-Classical Periodicals.....	
Hoadley, H.: see Chickering.....		See Reviews, Lowe.....	
Hodgman, A. W.: see Reviews, Sturtevant.....		Military Tactics of Caesar and of To-day, R. G. Kent.....	69-70
Hunter College, A Generous Offer by.....	152	Milo, Prosecution of, R. W. Husband.....	146-150, 156-159
Husband, R. W.: The Prosecution of Milo	146-150, 156-159	Mitchell, B. W.: see Reviews, Bice, Gallup.....	
The Prosecution of Sextus Roscius	90-93, 98-100	Mierow, C. C.: The War and the Classics.....	208
Interpreters, Use of, H. S. Gehman.....	9-14	Modern Psychology and Formal Discipline, W. A. Jenner.....	26-29
Janes, A. L. and Jenks, P. R.: Bellum Helveticum (Brewer).....	159	Moore, F. G.: A Grammatical Excursion.....	81-87
Jenner, W. A.: The Modern Psychology and Formal Discipline.....	26-29	Moore, J. H.: Two Lovers of the Classics.....	170-172
Johnson, A. C.: see Reviews, Ferguson.....		Murray, A. T.: The Anabasis (Guernsey).....	133-134
Johnson, F. P.: Another 'New' Thing that is Old	112	Murray, G.: Euripides and his Age (Scribner).....	77-78
Johnson, W. H.: Latin in an Ohio School.....	32	Mustard, W. P.: The Pastoral, Ancient and Modern	161-167
Jones, Anna S.: Latin in the Grades.....	130-132	The Piscatory Eclogues of Jacopo Sannazaro (McDaniel).....	71-72
Juret, C.: Dominance et résistance dans la phonétique latine (Kent).....	22-23	New Historical Material in the Revised State-Documents of Athens, K. K. Smith.....	50-55
		Notes.....	7, 128
		Nutting, H. C.: Language Work in the Grades	172-173
		O'Brien, P. F.: Virgil's Aeneid (Cleasby).....	70-71
		Offering to the Manes, R. G. Kent.....	144
		Oldfather, W. A.: The Fine Arts and the Classics	65-67

	PAGE		PAGE
Oliver, A.: see Reviews, Smiley		Reviews—Contd.	
Olmstead, A. T.: see Reviews, Ledl, Thallon		Hackforth, R.: The Authorship of the	
Pastoral, Ancient and Modern, W. P. Mustard	161-167	Platonic Epistles (Shorey)	173-174
Parker, C. P.: Vergil and the Country Pastor	74-77	Hall, H. R.: Aegean Archaeology (Hall)	190-191
Pease, A. S.: A Gallic Parallel	168	Harcum, Cornelia: Roman Cooks (Rolfe)	215
Penick, D. A.: Greek Poetry in English Trans-		Hendrickson, G. L.: see Allen, W. F. A	
lation	115-117	Janes, A. L. and Jenks, P. R.: Bellum	
Pickard-Cambridge, A. W.: Demosthenes and		Helveticum (Brewer)	159
the Last Days of Greek Freedom. 384-322		Jenks, P. R.: see Janes	
B. C. (Adams)	219-221	Juret, C.: Dominance et résistance dans	
Plautus, Captives of, acted at Mt. Holyoke		la phonétique latine (Kent)	22-23
College	224	Lease, E. B.: Livy I, XXI, XXII (Long)	224
Plutei to the Front, R. G. Kent	136	Ledl, A.: Studien zur älteren Athenischen	
Pound, Olivia M.: An Interesting Tribute to		Verfassungsgeschichte (Olmstead)	78-80
the Classics	96	Lewis, J. H.: The Two Great Republics,	
Powers, H. H.: The Message of Greek Art		Rome and the United States (Sage)	15-16
(Robinson)	29-32	Lowe, W. D.: Anecdotes from Pliny's	
Puncheon, Katherine M.: Liberal Studies in		Letters (Messer)	191
the High School Curriculum	2-4	Magoffin, R. V. D.: The Quinquennales,	
Radin, M.: The Reign of Syntax	210-213	An Historical Study (Dennison)	46
Reid, J. S.: The Municipalities of the Roman		Manatt, J. I.: Aegean Days (Robinson)	150-151
Empire (Ferguson)	93-94	Meillet, A.: Aperçu d'une histoire de la	
Reviews:		langue grecque (Sturtevant)	45-46
Alexander, L.: Kings of Lydia (Kent)	207-208	Murray, A. T.: The Anabasis (Guernsey)	133-134
Allen, W. F. A. and Katharine and Hen-		Murray, G.: Euripides and his Age	
drickson, G. L.: Tacitus, Agricola and		(Scribner)	77-78
Germania (Kellogg)	215-216	Mustard, W. P.: The Piscatory Eclogues	
Baker, Emilie K.: Greece and Rome		of Jacopo Sannazaro (McDaniel)	71-72
(Goodale)	16	O'Brien, P. F.: Virgil's Aeneid (Cleasby)	70-71
Barss, J. E.: Writing Latin (Rockwood)	176	Pickard-Cambridge, A. W.: Demosthenes	
Bennett, C. E.: The Syntax of Early		and the Last Days of Greek Freedom.	
Latin. Vol. — The Cases (Wheeler)	213-215	384-322 B. C. (Adams)	219-221
Bice, H. H.: Sight Reading (Mitchell)	143	Plautus, Captive of, acted at Mt. Holyoke	
Bouchier, E. S.: Spain under the Roman		College	224
Empire (Clark)	134-135	Powers, H. H.: The Message of Greek	
Brooks, A. M.: Architecture and the		Art (Robinson)	29-32
Allied Arts (Hamlin)	151-152	Reid, J. S.: The Municipalities of the	
Calhoun, G. M.: Athenian Clubs (Car-		Roman Empire (Ferguson)	93-94
roll)	159-160	Roper, A. E.: Ancient Eugenics (Mc	
Campbell, S. G.: Livy, XXVII (Lease)	127-128	Daniels)	206-207
Chickering, E. C. and Hoadley, H.: Be-		Rothe, C.: Die Odyssee als Dichtung,	
ginner's Latin by the Direct Method		und ihr Verhältniss zur Ilias (Scott)	62-64
(Foster)	199-200	Sihler, E. G.: Cicero of Arpinum (Shower-	
Clark, A. C.: Recent Developments in		man)	112
Textual Criticism (Clark)	118-119	Smiley, J. B.: and Storke, Helen L.: A	
Code, G. N.: When the Fates Decree		First Year Latin Course (Oliver)	182-183
(Henry)	6-7	Smith, M. L.: Latin Lessons (Walker)	141-143
Collins, J. C.: Greek Influence on En-		Storke, Helen L.: see Smiley	
glish Poetry (Van Hook)	125-127	Sturtevant, E. H.: P. Terenti Afri	
Cornford, F. M.: The Origin of Attic		Andria (Hodgman)	183
Comedy (Flickinger)	221-223	Thallon, Ida C.: Readings in Greek	
Daniels, E. D.: Latin Drill (Harwood)	111-112	History (Olmstead)	104
Douglas, S. O. G.: A Theory of Civil-		Thomson, J. A. K.: Studies in the Odys-	
ization (Magoffin)	117-118	sey (Shewan)	108-111
Duncan, T. S.: The Influence of Art on		Tunstall, R. W.: The Latin Ladder	
Description in the Poetry of Statius		(Gleason)	103-104
(Lipscomb)	167-168	Waldstein, C.: Greek Sculpture and	
Earle, M. L.: The Classical Papers of		Modern Art (Baur)	119-120
(Capps)	38-40	Walker, E. M.: The Hellenica Oxy-	
Egbert, J. C.: Livy (Sage)	5-6	rhynchia (Ferguson)	205-206
Ferguson, W. S.: Hellenistic Athens		Weigall, A. E. P. B.: Cleopatra (Bots-	
(Johnson)	100-101	ford)	174-175
Ferrero, G.: Ancient Rome and Modern		Whiting, Lilian: Athens, the Violet	
America and Between the Old World		Crowned (Robinson)	101-103
and the New (Sage)	175-176	Riess, E.: Caesar and the War	128
Gallup, F. A.: A Latin Reader (Mit-		Robinson, D. M.: Greek Literature in En-	
chell)	143	glish Translations	153-156
Gardner, P.: The Principles of Greek		See Reviews, Manatt,	
Art (Tonks)	14-15	Powers, Whiting	
Gordon, G. S.: English Literature and the		Rockwood, Mary B.: see Reviews, Barss	
Classics (Van Hook)	125-127	Rolfe, J. C.: see Reviews, Harcum	
		Roper, A. E.: Ancient Eugenics (McDaniel)	206-207

	PAGE		PAGE
Roscius, Sextus, Prosecution of, R. W. Husband	90-93, 98-100	Teaching Students How to Study Latin and Greek, T. B. Glass	43-45
Rothe, C.: Die <i>Ódysee</i> als Dichtung und ihr Verhältnis zur <i>Ilias</i> (Scott)	62-64	Thallon, Ida C.: Readings in Greek History (Olmstead)	104
Sage, E. T.: The Conservation of Natural Resources in the Roman Republic	58-61	Thomson, J. A. K.: Studies in the Odyssey (Shewan)	108-111
War, Ancient and Modern	136	Tonks, O.: see Reviews, Gardner	
See Reviews, Egbert, Ferrero, Lewis		Tunstall, R. W.: The Latin Ladder (Gleason)	103-104
School Editions of the Classics, B. W. Bradley	18-20	Two Lovers of the Classics, J. H. Moore	170-172
Scott, J. A.: <i>ῥηλόγος</i> in Apollonius Rhodius ..	7	Two Wars in Gaul, A. L. Keith	42-43
See Reviews, Rothe		Tyng, T. S.: The Direct Method and its Application to the Classical Languages 186-190, 194-199 ..	
Scribner, H. S.: see Reviews, Murray		Ullman, B. L.: see Editorials	
Sequence of Events after Caesar's Death, W. E. Caldwell	67-69	Van Hook, L. R.: see Reviews, Gordon, Collins	
Shewan, A.: see Reviews, Thomson		Vaughan, V. C.: The Value of the Classics ..	80
Shorey, P.: see Reviews, Hackforth		Vergil and the Country Pastor, C. P. Parker ..	74-77
Showerman, G.: see Reviews, Sihler		Waldstein, C.: Greek Sculpture and Modern Art (Baur)	119-120
Sihler, E. G.: Cicero of Arpinum (Showerman) ..	112	Walker, E. M.: The Hellenica Oxyrhynchia ..	205-206
Smiley, J. B. and Storke, Helen L.: A First Year Latin Course (Oliver)	182-183	Walker, N. A.: see Reviews, Smith	
Sloan, W.: Value of the Classics	8	War, Ancient and Modern, E. T. Sage	136
Smith, K. K.: New Historical Material in the Revised State-Documents of Athens ..	50-55	War and the Classics, The, C. C. Mierow	208
Smith, M. L.: Latin Lessons (Walker)	141-143	Weigall, A. E. P. B.: Cleopatra (Botsford) ..	174-175
Storke, Helen L.: see Smiley		Wheeler, A.: see Reviews, Bennett	
Sturtevant, E. H.: P. Terenti Afri <i>Andria</i> (Hodgman)	183	Whiting, Lilian: Athens, the Violet Crowned (Robinson)	101-103
See Reviews, Meillet		Yeames, H. H.: The <i>Alcestis</i> in English	176
A Rejoinder	216	See Classical Articles in Non-Classical Periodicals	

1-1915
UNIV. OF MICH.

The Classical Weekly

VOL. VIII

SATURDAY, MAY 29, 1915

No. 29

Just Published by
The Classical Association of the Atlantic States

A PAMPHLET OF 40 PAGES (exclusive of the covers), ENTITLED

THE PRACTICAL VALUE OF LATIN

Expressions by lawyers, physicians, journalists, engineers, scientists, educators and business men favorable to the Classics, as subjects having a direct meaning and use for those who plan to engage in various forms of so-called practical life. A pamphlet suitable for distribution among High School or Preparatory School pupils and among College students as well.

12 copies,	-	-	-	\$.50	100 copies,	-	-	-	\$3.50
25 "	-	-	-	1.00	160 "	-	-	-	5.00
50 "	-	-	-	1.90					

Larger quantities may be had at even lower rates.

The Teaching of English and the Study of the Classics

By PROFESSOR LANE COOPER

Reprinted from *The Classical Weekly*, 8. 178-182, as a 16-page pamphlet; deserves wide distribution among both friends and foes of the Classics.

12 copies,	-	-	-	\$.25	60 copies,	-	-	-	\$1.00
25 "	-	-	-	.50	100 "	-	-	-	1.50

Larger quantities may be had at even lower rates.

A good chance to do missionary work at small cost! Buy and distribute these pamphlets.

Address CHARLES KNAPP

Barnard College

NEW YORK CITY

A Helpful Supplementary Book

Leiper's Latin Subordinate Clause Syntax - - \$0.30

By M. A. LEIPER, Professor of Latin, Western Kentucky State Normal School.

THE purpose of this reference manual is to aid second and third year high school pupils in getting a clearer understanding of the various forms of subordinate clauses than is possible from the use of a grammar alone. It is intended to supplement, not to supplant, the latter, and consequently includes references to all the leading Latin grammars, so that the student may pursue his investigation further at any point.

Here is collected in compact, classified arrangement all the necessary information about these clauses and the various matters of syntax involved. This is at present scattered so widely, and hidden beneath such elaborate and difficult statements and beneath so many exceptions and illustrations in the grammars, that the student becomes thoroughly bewildered and discouraged.

AMERICAN BOOK COMPANY

NEW YORK

CINCINNATI

CHICAGO



THE SCHOLIA

ON THE

AVES OF ARISTOPHANES

By JOHN WILLIAMS WHITE

8 vo, cloth, cxii+378 pages, \$3.50

A scholarly collecting and editing of the old Greek commentary on Aristophanes's "Birds". The introduction presents a brief History of Annotation with special reference to comedy. The body of the work comprises a literal transcript of the Commentary found in the Codex Venetus 474 of the eleventh century and beneath this a collation of the five other manuscripts and of the first printed edition, and, facing transcript and collation, the restored text and notes. The book has been fully indexed by Professor Edward Capps of Princeton University.

GINN AND COMPANY

70 Fifth Avenue

NEW YORK



CAESAR'S GALLIC WAR BOOKS I AND II

With SELECTIONS for SIGHT READING

Edited by HARRY F. TOWLE
Late Principal Curtis High School, New York City

PAUL R. JENKS

Head Teacher of Latin, Flushing High School,
New York City

A Complete Second Year Latin Book

containing

Text with Notes
English-Latin Prose Exercises
Grammatical Appendix containing all Latin
Grammar illustrated in Caesar
Vocabulary to Books I and II
Selections for Sight Reading

Galic War—Books I and II \$0.85
Books I and II, with Selections for Sight Reading 1.20

D. C. HEATH & COMPANY

Boston New York Chicago

Widely Popular Text-Books

A LATIN GRAMMAR, 337 pp. - - - \$0.90
(H. E. BURTON)

This is a unique text because it is the only book on the market to-day which is sufficiently clear and simple for the beginner and also sufficiently complete and scholarly for the college student. Experienced teachers and professors are unanimous in their praises of this book.

CAESAR'S GALLIC WAR, 495 pp. - - - \$1.25
(GUNNISON AND HARLEY)

The contents of this book are so comprehensive and so well-organized that the pupil needs no other Latin helps during the second year. Four books of the Gallic War, Prose Composition, Sight Reading Selections and Grammar (with notes, vocabularies, etc.) make an unequalled school edition.

CICERO'S ORATIONS, 543 pp. - - - \$1.25
(GUNNISON AND HARLEY)

A really superb edition of Cicero for school use, this book gives seven Orations, Sight Reading Selections, Grammar and Prose Composition. It is really four books in one. The illustrations are unusual and artistic.

SILVER, BURDETT & COMPANY

BOSTON NEW YORK CHICAGO SAN FRANCISCO

Let your Latin Composition teach Syntax.

You can with the Baker and Inglis plan. Principle and practice are very closely allied. Each lesson consists of a definite assignment of some principles of syntax, a special vocabulary, a series of twenty-four sentences for written translation and an exercise for oral translation. A summary of the elements of syntax is included, which may be used for reference.

The sentences for written drill are divided into two groups, of which twelve may be used for written home work, and twelve for translation in the class period, thus providing a fresh review, in class, of principles worked out at home. For content and vocabulary, the sentences are based on Caesar's Commentaries and the Orations of Cicero read in the schools.

The course is divided for three years, the last of which is devoted to review of all the principles, and to practice in writing connected Latin.

Try it with BAKER AND INGLIS'S HIGH SCHOOL COURSE IN LATIN COMPOSITION.

THE MACMILLAN COMPANY

64-66 Fifth Avenue, New York City
Chicago Dallas Boston Atlanta San Francisco

The Direct Method of Teaching Latin

LINGUA LATINA SERIES

General Editors: { DR. W. H. D. ROUSE
S. O. ANDREW, M.A.

P. OVIDI NĀSŌNIS ELEGĪACA. Edited by L. R. STRANGE-WAYE. Crown 8vo, cloth, pp. 74 50c.

PUER RŌMANUS—By R. B. Appleton, M.A. and W. H. S. Jones, M.A. Crown 8vo; cloth, pp. 110. With illustrations.....60c.

DECEM FĀBULAE PUERIS PUELLISQUE AGENDAE. By W. L. PAINE, M.A., and C. L. MAINWARING, B.A., and Miss E. RYLE. With an introduction by W. H. D. ROUSE, M.A., Litt.D. Crown 8vo, cloth, pp. 96.....40c.

PRĪMUS ANNUS: By W. L. PAINE, M.A., and C. L. MAINWARING, B.A. With an introduction by S. O. ANDREW, M.A. Crown 8vo, cloth, pp. 138. With illustration50c.

PRAECEPTOR. A Master's Book. By S. O. ANDREW, M.A. Crown 8vo, cloth, pp. 10485c.

VILLA CORNELĪANA. A Wall Picture designed by E. M. CARTER to illustrate Life on a Roman Estate.....\$3.40

SELECTED LETTERS OF PLINY. Edited by G. B. ALLEN, M.A. Crown 8vo, pp. 149.....60c.
The text is Kukula's reprinted by permission of Messrs. Teubner.

THE OXFORD LATIN COURSE. Part I. From the Elements to the Text of Caesar's Campaigns in Britain. Modified to avoid the use of the subjunctive mood. By R. L. A. DUPONTET. Crown 8vo, cloth, pp. xvi + 302.....60c.
"This is a book with a single aim: to enable you in the shortest possible time to read a Latin author, and read him accurately".

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS AMERICAN BRANCH
35 West 32nd Street, NEW YORK

THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY is published by The Classical Association of the United States, weekly, on Saturdays, from October 1 to May 31 inclusive, except in weeks in which there is a legal or school holiday, at Barnard College, Broadway and 120th St., New York City.

All persons within the territory of the Association who are interested in the language, the literature, the life and the art of ancient Greece and ancient Rome, whether actually engaged in teaching the Classics or not, are eligible to membership in the Association. Application for membership may be made to the Secretary-Treasurer, Charles Knapp, Barnard College, New York. The annual dues (which cover also the subscription to THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY), are two dollars. Within the territory covered by the Association (New York, New Jersey, Pennsylvania, Delaware, Maryland, District of Columbia) subscription is possible to individuals only through membership in The Classical Association of the Atlantic States. To institutions in this territory the subscription price is one dollar per year. Outside the territory of the Association the subscription price of THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY is one dollar per year.

Managing Editor

CHARLES KNAPP, Barnard College, Columbia University

Associate Editors

CHARLES E. BENNETT, Cornell University

WALTER DENNISON, Swarthmore College.

WALTON B. McDANIEL, University of Pennsylvania

DAVID M. ROBINSON, The Johns Hopkins University

B. L. ULLMAN, University of Pittsburgh

H. H. YEAMES, Hobart College.

Business Manager

CHARLES KNAPP, Barnard College, New York City.

Communications, articles, reviews, books for review, queries etc., inquiries concerning subscriptions and advertising, back numbers or extra numbers, notices of change of address, etc., should be sent to Charles Knapp, Barnard College, New York City.

Single copies 10 cents. Extra numbers, 10 cents each: \$1.00 per dozen.

Printed by W. F. Humphrey, 30 Linden Street, Geneva, N. Y.

BEGINNERS' LATIN

BY THE DIRECT METHOD

By Edward C. Chickering, Ph. D., and Harwood Hoadley, Ph. D., of Jamaica High School, New York City

TEACHERS' EDITION, \$1.00

PUPILS' EDITION, 75c

CHARLES SCRIBNER'S SONS

NEW YORK

Chicago

Boston

Atlanta

San Francisco

Courses in Education, Teachers College, Columbia University, Summer Session, 1915

By DR. E. C. CHICKERING

- (1) Methods of Teaching Latin.
- (2) Demonstration Class in First Year Latin.

In (2) class of children will begin Latin by the Direct Method. After the daily lesson is concluded, that lesson will be discussed with the observing students. The Course will receive graduate credit only if taken with (1).

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY SUMMER SESSION

JULY 6—AUGUST 15, 1915

COMPARATIVE PHILOLOGY—

Pronunciation of Greek and Latin

Professor Sturtevant

GREEK—

Elementary Course

Professor Macurdy

Homer, Iliad

Professor Sturtevant

Greek Pastoral Poetry

Professor Macurdy

LATIN—

Elementary Course

Miss Wye
(for beginners)

Elementary Course

Miss Wye
(for (1) those reviewing 1st year work
(2) Students of Direct Method)

Vergil (Selections from), Aeneid I-VI

Mr. Demarest
(= Entrance Latin 5)

Cicero

Mr. Messer
(= Entrance Latin 4)

Prose Composition

Mr. Messer
(= Entrance Latin 6)

LATIN— (Continued)

Livy XXI-XXII

Professor Sturtevant
(= Latin A1)

Horace, Odes & Epodes

Professor McCrea
(= Latin A2)

Prose Composition—College Course

Professor Knapp

Prose Composition—Advanced College Course

Mr. Demarest

Vergil, Aeneid—Advanced Course

Professor McCrea

Roman Oratory

Professor Moore

Plautus and Terence

Professor Knapp

Latin Conversation

Miss Wye

Prose Composition—Graduate Course

Professor Moore

